



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
LAW DEPARTMENT

100 CHURCH STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10007

GEORGIA M. PESTANA
Corporation Counsel

Rachel M. DiBenedetto
Labor and Employment Law Division
phone: (212)-356-5031
email: rdibened@law.nyc.gov

February 4, 2022

Via NYSCEF

Justice Lyle E. Frank
Supreme Court of the State of New York
60 Centre Street
New York, New York 1007

Re: NYC Organization of Public Service Retirees, Inc. et al. v. Renee
Campion et al
Index No: 158815/2021
Law Dept. No.: 2021-028140

Dear Justice Frank:

In accord with the instructions of this Court, attached please find Respondents' bi-weekly report as emailed to Your Honor from The Alliance on February 3, 2022.

We thank the Court for its attention to this matter.

Respectfully submitted,
/s/ _____
Rachel M. DiBenedetto
Assistant Corporation Counsel

/s/ _____
William S.J. Fraenkel
Assistant Corporation Counsel

cc: **(VIA NYSCEF)**

All counsel of record

Via Email

Justice Lyle E. Frank
Supreme Court of the State of New York
60 Centre Street
New York, New York 1007

February 3, 2022

Re: NYC Organization of Public Services, Inc. et al. v. Renee Campion et al.
Index No: 158815/2021

Dear Justice Frank:

On behalf of Respondents, and pursuant to this Court’s December 14, 2021 order (NYSCEF Dkt. No. 166), we write to provide a third update on the implementation of the City’s new NYC Medicare Advantage Plus Plan (the “MA Plan”). Per the Court’s instruction, we provided an initial update on January 7, 2022, NYSCEF Dkt. No. 173, and a second update on January 21, 2022, NYSCEF Dkt. No. 182.

Below, we provide a further update on the efforts of Respondents and The Alliance to implement the MA Plan. Additionally, we provide a further response to Petitioners’ January 18 filings (NYSCEF Dkt. Nos. 174-79), addressed initially on January 21, and Petitioners’ January 28 submission (NYSCEF Dkt. No. 184), which contained additional misinformation from Petitioners. And we outline the steps we hope to take in the near-term, with the Court’s permission and the lifting of the current preliminary injunction.

Retiree Outreach

Since our January 21 update, we have continued to provide further outreach to retirees in several forms.

1. Webinars

Between “general attendance” webinars for retirees as well as those hosted in partnership with the unions, there have been over 100 retiree education meetings to date, presenting to tens of thousands of retirees. Twelve (12) additional general attendance webinars are scheduled through March, on the following dates: February 4, February 8, February 10, February 15, February 18, February 22, February 24, March 1, March 7, March 18, March 23, and March 29.¹

In addition to these general attendance webinars, we are continuing to schedule and conduct union-specific webinars, and have hosted several more since January 21. For example, a webinar with the Doctors Council on January 27, 2022 was over two hours long, primarily

¹ As we informed the Court on January 21, the member webinar has now been posted on The Alliance’s website for on-demand viewing by retirees at the following link: [NYC Medicare Advantage Plus Plan – Retiree Education 1/6/2022 1-Edited \(vbrick.com\)](#). The webinar is also available on OLR’s website, under the link “View the NYC Medicare Advantage Plus Plan Retiree Education Video.”

devoted to responding to retiree questions. The full schedule of upcoming union webinars is below:

- The Uniformed Fire Officers Association has scheduled three additional webinar dates, on February 9, 2022, February 16, 2022, and March 2, 2022.
- The Deputy Sheriff's Association has a session scheduled for February 4, 2022.
- The District Council 37 has sessions scheduled for February 4 and February 20, 2022.
- The United Firefighters Association has another webinar session scheduled for February 16, 2022.

2. Advertisements

We have continued to run advertisements (*see* Jan. 28 Letter, Ex. F) in major publications in the New York and Palm Beach, Florida areas, on the schedule set out in the January 28 submission.

3. Educational Video Series

The Alliance is continuing to develop an educational video series campaign about the MA Plan (including prior authorization, provider network basics, and additional health/wellness program information), and anticipates development concluding in mid-February.

Provider Outreach

Since our January 7 and January 21 updates, Respondents and The Alliance have continued to liaise with providers in numerous ways. In addition to all the outreach set out in the January 7 and January 21 updates:

1. Webinars

Additional provider webinars were conducted on January 14, January 19, January 21, January 26, and January 28, 2022. Further webinars have been scheduled and that schedule is outlined below. As we previously informed the Court, providers have been and will be invited to these webinars in several ways – through monthly provider newsletters, through regularly scheduled touchpoints with providers, via FAQs, and via email as an “e-vite.”

Date of Provider Webinar	Time of Provider Webinar
2/4/2022	8:30 - 9:30am EST
2/8/2022	4 - 5pm EST
2/24/2022	1 - 2pm EST
3/8/2022	3 - 4pm EST
3/16/2022	10 - 11am EST
3/22/2022	1 - 2pm EST
4/28/2022	Noon - 1pm EST
5/16/2022	9 - 10am EST
6/7/2022	1 - 2pm EST

2. Direct Mail Campaign

As mentioned in the January 21 update, we have continued the process of a new direct mail campaign to providers reminding them about the new MA Plan and urging them to review online materials for more information. *See* January 21 Ltr. & Ex. G. In addition to the nearly 500,000 mailings distributed on January 21 to New York providers, more than 300,000 additional mailings (306,060) were circulated to providers in 14 states last week.²

3. Email Campaign

We have also continued an email campaign to providers. Among other things, a provider update email (attached as **Exhibit I**) was circulated to all to all Florida in-network providers on January 28, 2022.

Emails were also sent to providers that have seen City retirees in the past in the following additional states:

BlueCross BlueShield Plan	# of Emails Sent
BCBSNC (NC)	10,000
IBC (PA)	1,951
BCBSMA (MA)	22,000
BCBSSC (SC)	302
BCBS AR (AR)	34
BCBSTN (TN)	1,367

² California, Colorado, Connecticut, Georgia, Indiana, Kentucky, Maine, Missouri, New Hampshire, Nevada, New York, Ohio, Virginia, and Wisconsin.

4. Telephonic Campaign

Additionally, The Alliance and its dedicated staff of more than 30 associates have continued their telephonic outreach campaign to providers across the country who have recently seen City retirees as patients. *See* Jan. 21 Ltr. at 3-4 (explaining methodology). As of today, The Alliance has undertaken more than 9,000 (9,233) outreach attempts to providers nationwide, including nearly 90 percent of provider targets in New York (2953/3272), 100 percent of provider targets in New Jersey (539/539³), and roughly 5 percent of provider targets in Florida (134/2953).

Response to Petitioners' Recent Submissions

In our January 21 submission, we provided an initial view as to how and why Petitioners' January 18 filings were (and were intended to be) full of misinformation, designed to obstruct implementation of the MA Plan. Since then, Petitioners have confirmed their full-bore opposition to the MA Plan, regardless of how it is implemented. Among other things, Petitioners' website included this guidance to members on January 28:

Send a Valentine or ANY Day Message to Mayor Adams!

1. Copy the following message:

Dear Mayor Adams,

Please Don't Break Our Hearts. Don't put Retirees into the MAPP.

Remember, YOU are a RETIREE Too!

2. Click the **SEND** link below. You will be directed to the **CONTACT THE MAYOR** Web page.

3. **Paste** the message (or enter your own) and if you would like, add your Union and or Agency.

HAPPY VALENTINE or ANY DAY!!

Petitioners are simply not bothering to hide their complete opposition to the MA Plan; their views on implementation must be understood in this light.

An analysis of Petitioners' January 18 submissions regarding providers that allegedly are not going to accept the MA Plan is attached here as **Exhibit J**. As with Petitioners' prior submissions, the vast majority of the cited providers are, in fact, in-network for the MA Plan, or have been recently contacted by the Alliance to advise them about the plan's details.⁴ Nor, other

³ The Alliance previously estimated more provider targets in New Jersey (Jan. 21 Ltr. at 4), but that figure included certain specialist provider types (e.g., anesthesiology, radiology, emergency medicine) who were later removed from the target list because retirees/members do not typically select such providers, who typically bill on a patient's behalf regardless of insurance type.

⁴ In sum, more than 70 percent (144/201) of the identifiable providers listed in the affidavits are in-network, and many more providers indicated, in response to outreach from The Alliance, that they would accept the MA Plan as out-of-network providers ("OON").

than what Petitioners are attempting to conjure for the Court’s benefit, is there any mass confusion regarding which providers are in-network or will accept the MA Plan. To the contrary, as with our January 21 submission, less than five percent of the thousands of calls to The Alliance’s call center since January 21 are seeking information regarding provider participation. This is inconsistent with any claim of mass confusion about provider status asserted by Petitioners; that is because those claims are utterly false.

Petitioners’ January 28 letter also previews additional avenues of misinformation.

“Retirees who request printed copies of the MAP’s Evidence of Coverage are being told none are available.” This is pure misdirection – the Evidence of Coverage (EOC) is a *post-enrollment* document not required to be provided in writing until enrollment is complete. The EOC has been posted online as an added benefit to City retirees, but the Court never ordered Respondents to provide written copies of the EOC, as opposed to copies of the updated Enrollment Guide, which we are providing on demand (as well as written copies of the prior authorization-specific flyer).

“The webinars being hosted by the City and the Alliance are little more than one-way commercials.” Again, this is untrue – the vast majority of webinars have included question and answer periods, and all retiree questions posed in chat boxes during webinars are eventually answered by customer service representatives if not addressed during live sessions.

Retirees have been sent the wrong documents. This, unlike Petitioners’ other charges, is true. Between January 7 and January 28, The Alliance fulfilled 6,005 retiree requests for hard-copies of Enrollment Guides. We recently learned that some of those fulfillments accidentally contained materials for different plans. In a large-scale logistical project like this supplemental educational effort, some errors are inevitable, and as soon as The Alliance became aware of this issue, it began immediately contacting affected retirees and overnighting corrected materials. It remains telling, of course, that Petitioners never brought any such issue to The Alliance’s attention, or asked for corrected materials on behalf of retirees.⁵ That is because, of course, Petitioners’ intent is to obstruct, not actually to get retirees accurate information.

Next Steps

Petitioners’ January 28 submission purports to “reiterate” objections to the data transfers needed to implement the MA Plan. As we previously informed the Court during the December 8, 2021 hearing, Petitioners’ objections are baseless. The Court is aware from our prior exchanges that, in advance of the start date of a new health plan, numerous logistical steps are required. A new student might “start” at a school on September 1, but the application, acceptance, and enrollment processes all happen before then, sometimes considerably so; so too with health plans generally, and the MA Plan specifically.

⁵ The same goes for any alleged errors in The Alliance’s databases – which, based on our analyses of Petitioners’ submissions to date, are overstated.

Respondents and The Alliance are eager for the preliminary injunction to be lifted and implementation to begin because significant behind-the-scenes work is required. With apologies if the Court is already aware of some of what follows:

- To start, the City must initiate the enrollment process by processing and transferring certain data from its payroll system to The Alliance for City retirees as a group (save those retirees who have already opted out of the MA Plan). Importantly, this would *not* prevent the ongoing opt-out/opt-in processes from continuing through March 31, 2022, or the plan switching period (through June 30, 2022) from being implemented, because individual retirees' information can and would be re-added to the City's payroll system as needed. After the group data transfer is made, if a retiree later chose to opt out of the MA Plan, that retiree's information could be individually input back into the City's payroll system to allow that retiree to resume his or her prior health care coverage. But the initial group transfer is needed to allow the enrollment process to begin for the vast majority of the City's ~250,000 retirees who have *not* opted out from the MA Plan.⁶
- Once the City makes its initial transfer of payroll data, The Alliance will use that data to prepare enrollment files for the MA Plan, which will be securely submitted to the federal Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services ("CMS"). Once the enrollments are accepted, health plan materials (member IDs, welcome kits) must be distributed to retirees.

Each of these steps takes time, and must be done in a timely way to satisfy CMS requirements and provide a better, smoother transition for retirees. More to the point: it is hardly irrational or arbitrary to begin enrollment activities for a health plan of the MA Plan's significant size approximately two months before the tentative start date for the plan; indeed, it is common-sensical and completely consistent with the extensive experience of The Alliance's group health teams. To the extent Petitioners have suggested otherwise, we respectfully submit that their position is unsubstantiated and meritless; Petitioners have no background in how enrollment for large group Medicare Advantage plans is or should be handled, and have submitted no evidence or expert opinion on the matter. They have not remotely discharged their burden of showing any irrationality in the City's desired course.

For that reason, we continue to urge the Court to dissolve the preliminary injunction immediately. For all the reasons contained in previous filings – including the extensive, above-and-beyond educational efforts that have been made and will continue to be made, and retirees' ability to opt out of the MA Plan through March 31, 2022 and switch plans through the end of June 2022 – it would not be arbitrary and capricious to begin implementation now.

⁶ The Alliance understands from Respondents that once initial group data transfer commences, it would be extraordinarily difficult to undo the process in any reasonable amount of time.

We are looking forward to discussing the issue with the Court on Monday, and will provide the Court with any updated information before then if we think it would assist the Court's consideration of the issues.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Michael E. DeLarco

Michael E. DeLarco
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
390 Madison Avenue
New York, New York 10017

Counsel for The Alliance

cc: All counsel of record

EXHIBIT I

January 2022

NYC Medicare Advantage Plus Plan

Effective April 1, 2022, more than 200,000 Medicare-eligible City of New York retirees will transition to the NYC Medicare Advantage Plus plan. This is an update to the originally communicated effective date of January 1, 2022.

The NYC Medicare Advantage Plus plan is a Medicare Advantage PPO group retiree offering through an alliance between Empire BlueCross BlueShield (Empire) and EmblemHealth. The plan allows retirees to visit any doctor nationally that accepts Medicare while ensuring the provider gets paid their negotiated contractual rate or 100% of the Medicare allowed rate if non-contracted (less any member copay).

Are you in-network?

If you are contracted with your local Blue plan's Medicare Advantage PPO network, you are already an in-network provider participating in this plan. You should continue to see your City of New York retiree patients and submit claims to your local Blue Cross Blue Shield plan.

Out-of-network?

No problem, you can see City of New York retirees and still get paid 100% of the Medicare allowed rate — no contract required:

- You can continue seeing our members as long as you are eligible to receive payments from Medicare.
- Your reimbursement is the same as under original Medicare.
- Our members are not required to obtain a referral before they see a provider.

What are the benefits of the NYC Medicare Advantage Plus plan?

You will notice easier administration with one integrated plan. You no longer need to submit claims to both original Medicare and the Medicare supplemental plan, and you will receive one payment for both Medicare covered and supplemental services.

How to submit claims: You should submit all claims to your local plan for processing:

1. **By mail:** Submit paper claims to your local Blue Cross Blue Shield plan.
2. **By electronic submission:** Submit electronically to your Blue Cross Blue Shield plan.

Please be sure to include:

- The amount the member paid. The member's copay amount will be noted on their ID card for commonly used services.
- The three-digit alpha prefix N6Y that precedes the member ID number listed on the front of their card.

Florida Blue Medicare is an Independent Licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association. The NYC Medicare Advantage Plus plan is offered through an alliance between Empire BlueCross BlueShield Retiree Solutions and EmblemHealth. Empire and EmblemHealth have come together to create a new, customized, fully insured Group Medicare Advantage program for the City of New York.

EXHIBIT J

Exhibit I - Response to Affidavits Submitted by Petitioners on January 18, 2022
February 3, 2022

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
Affidavit 176							
176	1	Martin Jacobs, Ph.D. Notary: Cathy E. Blanco	I, Martin Jacobs, PhD was looking up on Find Care to find out which of my doctors accepts the new Medicare Advantage Plus Plan. I was shocked to find my own name on the list since I have never been approached to join as a provider on the new Alliance Plan. I am a licensed NY State Psychologist #011021	Martin Jacobs	New York / Colorado	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
176	2	Martin Jacobs, Ph.D. Notary: Cathy E. Blanco	Spoke to Manager Hirupe (Nirupe?) "We are still working on it. So far we do not have information from the MAPP whether we accept MAPP" "The best way to find out if Dr. Huberfeld is in the [can't decipher] is to call Colorado Advantage Plan and give them Dr. Huberfeld's NPI #1114014800" I, Dr. Martin Jacob found that Dr. Huberfeld is listed in "FindCare" Aliyah at front desk: "We will only know if MAPP is accepted if I, Aliyah have a bill for patient for Dr. Huberfeld"	Dr. Seymour Huberfeld [REDACTED]	New York / Colorado	PAR	Communicated to several locations of Northwell Health via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
176	3	Martin Jacobs, Ph.D. Notary: Cathy E. Blanco	I spoke to billing department (Melissa) on 1/13/22. She said she received information from NYC Retirees. Emblem / GHI Medicare Advantage Plus Plan. They are accepting this plan. She said "she had no knowledge of the MAPP from Colorado, although it might be connected to the Emblem Plan Organization." I, Dr. Martin Jacobs, found Dr. Lee's name on the "Find Care" list.	Dr. Richard Lee [REDACTED]	New York / Colorado	PAR	Communicated to several locations of Northwell Health via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
176	4	Martin Jacobs, Ph.D. Notary: Cathy E. Blanco	I spoke to Ann in billing. She told me that Dr. Mitgang did not [undeciphered] out of Colorado Plan of Medicare Advantage Plus. He is <u>not</u> listed on the website. [Undeciphered] "No one was told anything. Retirees unions decided to dump certain people...if you belong to a specific company within the MAPP you are automatically "in"." "But if you did <u>not</u> know about the plan then you had to specifically ask to join." "Dr. Mitgang or his associate Dr. Shakui are <u>not</u> listed. So maybe the listing is not accurate or complete at the present time." "If you call NYC MAPP, they <u>may</u> give you information whether Dr. Mitgang is participating" "I (Ann) don't know if Dr. Mitgang was given the option to join. None of the doctors were ever notified about the plan." "If you call the insurance company they will tell you, but [undeciphered] the list it does not indicate anything. "No participation" but it could be wrong. This is very confusing. If enough patients want the MAPP, then Dr. Mitgang will allow it...but he was never approached by the MAPP." I Dr. Jacobs did <u>not</u> find Dr. Mitgang on the list	Dr. Charles Mitgang [REDACTED]	New York / Colorado	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
176	5	Martin Jacobs, Ph.D. Notary: Cathy E. Blanco	Spoke to Diana in billing: "Dr. Wein was never contacted by NYC or Alliance with regards to MAPP" "We had 3 of our patients, City workers, who came to Dr. Wein's office with letters they had received. I called 3 different phone numbers to inquire about the Medicare Advantage Plus Plan." "Each number I called, I had to wait a long time." "Finally, a person answered the phone by telling me that the patient needed an ID number before they could verify whether Dr. Wein participated in the patient's plan. And once they got the ID number of a patient who is in MAPP and with an ID (2 factors necessary), only then could they check whether Dr. Wein was in the MAPP." "So we at Dr. Wein are in limbo, not believing information." Dr. Jacobs: "It sounds like first pass the bill, then you will find out what's in it" Diana: "Correct" I, Dr. Jacobs found Dr. Wein's name listed on "Find Care"	Dr. Paul Wein [REDACTED] Mt. Sinai (Brooklyn)	New York / Colorado	PAR	Communicated to several locations of Mt. Sinai via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
Affidavit 177							

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
177	12	Denis Levine, Retiree	<p>...Yesterday, Thursday January 6, 2022, I had a telehealth appointment with my psychiatrist, Gavin Friedman. Near the end of the appointment, he asked if my secondary healthcare insurance had changed. I said it hadn't and asked what had happened. He replied that he had put through a claim, which was rejected because, "the account is INACTIVE."...</p> <p>... "Essence explained that I was "automatically switched over to BlueCross/BlueShield because you didn't opt out." I asked when the plan began and she said, "It begins on April 1st." I asked why I was already switched, and she said, "Because you didn't opt out."</p>	Gavin Friedman, psychiatrist	Fort Lauderdale, Florida	Non PAR	
Affadavit 178							
178	2	Dr. Ruth Jacks Notary: Cathy E Blanco	Missing Information: Most of my doctors are listed in the new plan except for Gary L[undeciphered], MD. When I called the doctors in the plan, none of the office staff could give me information about pre-approvals on the MAPP. Will the four biopsies each year be covered / allowed on the new plan? No information at this time! If not now, when? How can I make an informed decision without all of the information? I'm a cancer survivor and to keep me okay, these procedures are necessary. I'm always covered on Medicare. What's the bottom line with the new plan?	Gary L (undeciphered), MD.	N/A	N/A	
178	4	Dr. Ruth Jacks Notary: Cathy E Blanco	Wow! Here we go again! More lies! My husband, Dr. Martin Jacks found his name when searching "Find Care" on MAP! He has never been asked to join, nor does he plan to as a provider but his name is listed!	Dr. Martin Jacks	N/A	N/A	1/27 - Unable to locate provider with information given.
178	5	Barry Elin, retiree Notary: Leonard Schuss	Spoke to the billing department of Dr. David Hoch...I was informed that Dr. Hoch will NOT be accepting the new, NYC Medicare Advantage Plus Plan	Dr. David Hoch	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	6	Lisa Seckler-Roode, retiree Notary: Samantha Belsacher	As of this date, January 11, 2022 per the Advantage Plan site, I searched to see if my physician...was going to be a participating member of this pending medical plan. He was, in fact, listed on their website as being "participating". I contacted Dr. Ladinsky's Billing Department, only to be told the following; they have NOT been contacted by the City of New York and have absolutely no intention of participating.	Dr. Michael Ladinsky	East Islip, NY	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	7	Alan J. Odze, retiree Notary: Elba Alvez	Please Take Notice that Doctor Paul Finger... is listed as accepting the MAP that the city of New York wants to implement. However, according to the Office Manager the Office refuses to accept MAP. Which will force me to pay for the services upfront and request reimbursement. As I have stated this will cause me severe financial stress as I cannot afford to pay for the services upfront and maybe get some reimbursement.	Dr. Paul Finger, New York Eye Cancer	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) ([REDACTED]) Contacted 1/15; telephonic (spoke to office)
178	8	Mr. Angel L. Rivera, retiree Notary: Vivian Kleiner	Went to the Care database and none of my doctors' names (Mohrer; Golduber, Wald; Mishail) appear. Called my most utilized network hospital, NYU Langone, 646-754,2000, spoke with Carmen in Billing. She sees no such plan listed and gave reference #3250994 for this call. Also spoke to Jeannine (646-929-7800) from Patient Access. She also does not see any NYC MAPP. Both departments do not see any communication from the City or the Alliance.	Mohrer; Golduber; Wald; Mishail	NYU Langone, although unclear if all four doctors are associated with NYU Langone or if he just also called this hospital	PAR PAR PAR PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021); (Jonathan and Daniel Mohrer; Gary Golduber; Kenneth, Barbara and Leonard Wald; Alek Mishail)
178	9	Carolyn Hornik, retiree Notary: Kevin Hornik	I have reached out to the billing department of my pain management doctor. No one has heard of the NYC MAPP. They haven't received information advising them of the plan and therefore, do not know if they will be participating in the plan.	Not given	Not given	N/A	

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
178	11	Clorinda Cooke, retiree Notary: Patrick Elle	I contacted the office of our doctors... I was told they had never heard of NYCMAPP, and have not been contacted by the Alliance or NYC about the plan.	Dr. Tobe Rubin Dr. Francesco Rotatori	Dr. Rubin Ophthalmology Consultants [REDACTED] Dr. Rotatori [REDACTED]	PAR PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022), Letters (11/12/2021) and Email.
178	13	Denise Gaudio, retiree Notary: Katlynn Hutt	<p>Today, 1/12/2022, I visited the website of NYC MAP to make sure that the doctors that I see want to see are participating in the MAP. Drs. Rodricks, Bogdan and Poloczycy are physicians at Brielle Orthopedics, in Brick, NJ. Dr. Rubinsein is at NYP, Hudson Valley HOSpital. All of them are listed as IN Network. Due to the fact that I'd previously received incorrect information, I called their offices.</p> <p>At Brielle Orthopedics, I spoke with Wendy from Billing, and she offered their tax ID, 824413259. She informed me that they would not be participating in the MAP, and contrary to information on the MAP website, they are accepting new patients. She informed me that the office had been contacted by the MAP. She referred me to their website to see the insurances that are accepted. They accept Senior Care.</p> <p>At NYP Hudson Valley, I spoke to Julie in Billing. She recalled many calls from OLR and me. During all of my calls, I was told that Dr. Rubinstein would not participate in the MAP, yet OLR told me he would accept the MAP. Julie informed me again, that he would accept Medicare, but I would be responsible for the remaining 20%. I've been seeing him since 2018, with no problems with Senior Care.</p> <p>Inquiries to the above named physicians have been ongoing for MONTHS. I've contacted OLR and my Union, and was contacted by a gentleman named Tony, from BCBS about a month ago. His number is 303.869.3211.</p>	Dr. Rodrick, Bogdan, and Polowcyck Dr. Rubinstein	Physicians at Brielle Orthopedics, Brick, NJ NYP, Hudson Valley Hospital	PAR PAR	<p>Bogdan - contacted 1/13; telephonic (voicemail left)</p> <p>Rubinstein - Contacted 1/18; telephonic (spoke to office) Rubinstein - Communicated to several locations of NYP Hospital via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)</p>
178	15	Geraldine Paugh, retiree Notary: Julie K. Moore	Spoke with billing today and they are aware of the NYC Advantage Plus Plan. They have no contract with them and will accept it for established patients only.	Intercoastal Medical Group	FL (?)	Non PAR	
178	17	Irving Joffee, retiree Notary: Katherine Castle	<p>At 10:42am on 1/12/22, I spoke with Carolyn at the Carolina East billing center. Carolina East has not heard from the NYC MAPP. They have not heard from the doctors that they will accept the plan. Carolina East generally will bill Medicare Advantage plans as a courtesy. Depending on the plan they are sometimes paid as if they are in network. They do not accept HMO plans but do accept PPO plans. They could not tell what they would accept from the proposed NYC MAPP until they saw the insurance cards.</p> <p>At 12:20am I spoke to Lisa at CCHC and was told the following: They accept all Medicare Advantage plans from Blue Cross and get paid as if they are in network, but they never heard of this NYC MAPP and do not know what it is. They do not accept HMO plans but accept the PPO plans. There is always a \$15 co-pay for each visit with the Medicare Advantage Plans.</p> <p>Also shared screenshots that Carolina East Hospital and Health Care Services is not on the "Find Care" search as of 1/11/22. Additionally, shared screenshot that Coastal Carolina Health Care is not in the network using the "Find Care" search on 1/11/22. See more information to the right.</p>	<p>Carolina East Hospital - not shown on "Find Care"</p> <p>Costal Carolina Health Care - not shown on "Find Care"</p> <p>CCHC PCPs - Craig Zavelo, Joseph Healy, and Ronald Lather appear as being "in network"</p> <p>Carolina East physician, Alex Kirby, cardiologist not shown on "Find Care"</p> <p>Coastal Carolina Health Care Imaging Center - not shown in "Find Care"</p>	North Carolina	Non PAR Non PAR Non PAR Non PAR Non PAR	<p>1/28 - Spoke with Miranda in Medicare billing and handles BCBS for Coastal Carolina Health Care. [REDACTED]. She advised they are INN with BCBS NC and will accept any BCBS plan.</p> <p>1/28 - Spoke to Eleana with Carolina East Medical Center billing. [REDACTED]. She advised they accept all Medicare Advantage plans although they are OON for all.</p>

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
178	21	Joel Simon, retireex Notary: David Pollock	I used the "Find Care" link on the NYC MAPP site and found that the following two doctors of mine are listed as accepting this new plan... However, when I spoke to someone in the billing department from both doctors, I was told that they have not received any documentation, nor have they been contacted about the NYC MAPP. Both departments would not say whether the NYC MAPP would be accepted.	Charles B. Stone Leonard Kaufman	Internal Medicine [REDACTED] Urologist [REDACTED]	PAR PAR	Contacted by email
178	23-24	Judith S. Gruen, retiree Notary: Kathleen Deflaun	I spoke to the biller, as well as to the physician, at Dr. Friedman's office and this is what they both said: 1. They are NOT accepting the NYC MAPP 2. They had heard about it from other patients of theirs. 3. They have NEVER been contacted by the Alliance or by NYC or by anybody connected with this plan. I spoke to the biller, the office manager and the physician at Dr. Schaffner's office and this is what they all said: 1. They did not know the NYC MAPP 2. They had never heard of it 3. They have NEVER been contacted by the Alliance, by NYC, or by anybody else connected with this plan.	Dr. Robert Friedman, MD Dr. Adam Schaffner, MD	[REDACTED] [REDACTED]	Non PAR Non PAR	1/28 (Friedman) - Spoke to Julianna in billing @ [REDACTED]. Informed of the new product. Per the doctor, they will not be accepting this new plan. Dr. Friedman is OON for all MA and Commercial plans and will only accept Traditional Medicare. Product was fully explained and they do not wish to accept. 1/28 (Schaffner) - Called [REDACTED]. Only able to Leave message for Dr. Schaffner to return call. Dr. Schaffner will usually accept any insurance as long as there are OON benefits. he is not contracted with any MA plans. 1/28 - Dr. Schaffner returned the call and advised he is willing to bill as OON provider. (Schaffner) Communicated to several locations via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) but not at zip code 10028 or 10022
178	25	Leslie Parrino Notary: Megan Schalch	I currently reside in Sarasota, FL and have asked three of my doctors if they received any information from the CoNY on their new health plan for retirees NYC Medicare plus program. All three Doctors did not receive any information from the CoNY and they will not accept it. They only will accept my current plan.	Dr. Collins Dr. Sforzo Dr. Lento	[REDACTED]	PAR PAR PAR	Contact by email.
178	28	Marcia Biederman, retiree Notary: Neil Patel	Retired member of UFT. On 1/11/22, I called my office of my longtime gynecologist, Dr. John Maher... I asked two questions to which I got answers: 1) I asked if Dr. Maher would be participating in the new NYC MAPP. The office worker who answered my call said, "He hasn't decided". 2) I asked if Dr. Maher's office had been contacted by the CoNY or the Alliance about the NYC MAPP. The answer was no. The office worker told me that Dr. Maher's office had not gotten an email or been contacted in any way. She assured me that she would have known if any such outreach had been made.	Dr. Maher	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) Contacted 1/14; telephonic (Spoke to Office)

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
178	29	Mark Shernieoff Notary: Mary Peralta	I called the offices of the following physicians and practices and was told that they didn't know anything about it, other than what they may have heard from patients, and no one from the plan had called to them to tell them about it or to enroll them in the plan.	Orthopedic Center of Palm Beach County Tayla Schwarzberg, MD Benjamin Tripp, MD Retina Group of Florida Lawrence Clewner, MD	Orthopedic Center of Palm Beach County [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Dr. Schwarzberg Cancer Center of South Florida [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Dr. Tripp [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Retina Group of Florida [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Dr. Clewner Clewner & Kelly [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	PAR Non PAR PAR PAR PAR	All PAR providers contacted by Email.
178	31	Martin Horowitz	(i) not accepting MAPP, (ii) awaiting clarification from NYC.	Dr. Jeffrey Loewy, Cardiovascular Medical Associates	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	31	Martin Horowitz	(i) not accepting MAPP, (ii) awaiting clarification from NYC.	Dr. Richard Schwartz	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated to several locations of NYU Langone via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	32	Michael Grieco	(i) not listed on NYC MAP, (ii) have not been contacted. Accept Blue Medicare Advantage PPO	Dr. Diego Fiorento	Absecon, NJ	PAR	1/28 - Called Billing @ [REDACTED]. Advised needing to call [REDACTED] Ext. 103. Was transferred again to the Concern Dept., Naseem @ [REDACTED]. Only able to LM. 1/31 - Only able to Im for Office Mgr. Gave details to rep that took message. Office Mgr. out with Covid. No ETA.
178	32	Michael Grieco	(i) not listed on NYC MAP, (ii) have not been contacted. Accept Blue Medicare Advantage PPO	Dr. Mohamed H. Elnahal	NJ	PAR	1/28 - Called [REDACTED]. Left Detailed Message. 1/31 - Left detailed message for Katie Reed.
178	32	Michael Grieco	(i) not listed on NYC MAP, (ii) have not been contacted. Accept Blue Medicare Advantage PPO	Dr. Stanley Marczyk	Galloway, NJ	PAR	1/28 - Called [REDACTED]. LM for Karen. 1/31 - Spoke to Karen. Informed of new eff date. They are INN with Horizon MA plans. Willing to accept.

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
178	32	Michael Grieco	(i) not listed on NYC MAP, (ii) have not been contacted. Accept Blue Medicare Advantage PPO	Dr. Duk H. Kim	Galloway, NJ	PAR	1/28 - Called [REDACTED] Left Detailed Message. 1/31 - Only able to LM. Provider is with Atlanticare and they are willing to accept plan from previous call to Atlanticare provider.
178	32	Michael Grieco	(i) not listed on NYC MAP, (ii) have not been contacted. Accept Blue Medicare Advantage PPO	Atlanticare Mainland Hospital	Galloway, NJ	PAR	1/28 - Called [REDACTED]. Spoke to Kell. Informed of new product and eff. Date. They are willing to accept.
178	32	Michael Grieco	(i) not listed on NYC MAP, (ii) have not been contacted. Accept Blue Medicare Advantage PPO	LabCorp	Galloway, NJ	PAR	Communicated to several locations of LabCorp via Letters (11/12/2021)
178	34	Miriam Bluestone	(i) listed as in network, (ii) hospital has not determined if it will participate in MAPP.	Dr. Rebecca Siegel, Mt. Sinai Brooklyn Heights		PAR	Communicated to several locations of NYP Hospital via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	34	Miriam Bluestone	(i) listed as in network, (ii) have not received outreach	Dr. Francisca Yao, ENT and Allergy Associates	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	34	Miriam Bluestone	(i) listed as in network, (ii) office said that they are not in network for the plan and member would have to pay more.	Dr. Jonathan Kirschner, Hospital for Special Surgery		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	35	Peter C. Cherr	(i) listed on Findcare in wrong locations, (ii) office has not enrolled to be in MAP, (iii) has stopped taking Medicare (5 months ago).	Dr. Craig Antell		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) Contacted 1/19; Telephonic (left voicemail)
178	35	Peter C. Cherr	(i) listed on Findcare, (ii) office says not enrolled in MAPP, (iii) is enrolled in other BC MA plans, (iv) office has tried "for quite a while" to get taken out of this list and are having "great difficulty" with Alliance. Put in NYC MAP without his agreement.	Dr. Michael Burnett	Manhattan	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) Contacted 1/15; telephonic (spoke to office)
178	35	Peter C. Cherr	(i) on Findcare at a wrong location, (ii) still decided if they want to participate in MAP.	Dr. Jeffrey Schneller	Queens	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	36	Renata L. De Luca	(i) not on findcare, (ii) office has not received outreach.	Dr. Gottlock Robbins		PAR	Confirmed available on Find Care; Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021); Provider is affiliated with Northwell - communications have also been shared at the leadership level
178	36	Renata L. De Luca	(i) not on findcare, and (ii) office has not received outreach.	Lawrence G. Mendelowitz		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	37	Ruth Oaklander	(i) listed on website, (ii) office says they will not accept MAPP.	Dr. M. Angelillo	[REDACTED]	PAR	Contacted by email.
178	40/41	Adina Schwartz	(i) not listed on Findcare, (ii) MAP would be out of network, (iii) office had not been contacted.	Dr. David Lefkowitz, NY Presbyterian/Weill Cornell Medical Center		PAR	Communicated to several locations of NYP Hospital and Weill Cornell Medical Centers via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	40/41	Adina Schwartz	(i) not on Findcare, (ii) would not be accepting MAPP, (iii) office had not been contacted.	Dr. Brian D. Gelbman, NY Presbyterian/Weill Cornell Medical Center		Non PAR	Communicated to several locations of NYP Hospital and Weill Cornell Medical Centers via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	40/41	Adina Schwartz	(i) not in Findcare, (ii) office had not been contacted.	Dr. Lisa Dabney, Mount Sinai		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	40/41	Adina Schwartz	(i) not in Findcare, (ii) unsure if office will be accepting, (iii) not received any information.	Dr. Eric Elowitz, Will Cornell		Non PAR	Communicated to several locations of Weill Cornell Medical Centers via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
178	40/41	Adina Schwartz	(i) not in Findcare, (ii) had not received any information/contact.	Dr. Blair Lewis, Mount Sinai		PAR	Communicated to several locations of Mt. Sinai via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	42		(i) in network on Findcare, (ii) no longer accepting Medicare and therefore not accepting MAPP.	Dr. Federico P. Girardi		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	43	Candida Carcana	(i) none of the three doctors in the office are accepting MAP, (ii) have not received any information/contact on the plan.	NYU Langone - Dr. Lawrence Phillips, Dr. Larry Chinityz, Dr. James Borin		PAR PAR PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	44	Charles Trachta	(i) not in network, (ii) have not received communication on plan.	PCP and Urologist	Virginia	N/A	
178	44	Charles Trachta	(i) in network, (ii) office says not part of plan, (iii) have received no communication on plan.	Cardiologist	Virginia	N/A	
178	46	Creola C. Griffin	(i) office said they do not participate in MAPP.	Dr. Charles Ross, Eagles Family Medicine		PAR	1/28 - Called [REDACTED]. Spoke to Andrea. Advised new plan. She advised they will be willing to accept plan.
178	46	Creola C. Griffin	(i) office said they do not participate in MAPP.	Dr. Angela Hawkes, Greensboro Rheumatology		Non PAR	1/28 - Called [REDACTED]. Office hrs. M-Thurs 8 to 4:30, Fri 8 to 1. Unable to LM. Needing to call next week. 1/31 - Spoke to Heather. She advised they are willing to accept OON benefits for BCBS MA plan.
178	46	Creola C. Griffin	(i) office said they do not participate in MAPP.	Dr. Kashyap Kansupada, Charlotte Eye, Ear, Nose and Throat Associates		Non PAR	1/28 - Called [REDACTED]. Only able to LM. 1/31 - Excessive wait time. Wait 10 mins and was still number 30 in que. LM for callback.
178	46	Creola C. Griffin	(i) listed as in network, (ii) office said that they do not participate in MAPP, and (iii) have not received any communications.	Dr. Bindubal Balan		PAR	1/28, Lori Hendrick, Billing, left a detailed message. 1/31, Lana transferred me to the billing voicemail box. I left a detailed message.
178	46	Creola C. Griffin	(i) office said they do not participate in MAPP.	Dr. Frank Moya, Duke Eye Center of Winston Salem		Non PAR	1/28, left a message on general billing vm. 1/31, Kara, billing, provider her with the information regarding change. She suggested I speak with Hannah Long, financial counselor. She was unavailable so I left a detailed message on her VM.
178	48	Denise Rickles	(i) not participating in MAPP, (ii) not received any communication	Dr. Grace Sun, Weill Cornell		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	48	Denise Rickles	(i) not in the MAPP, (ii) not received any communication.	Dr. Po Ching Fond, Weill Cornell		Non PAR	Communicated to several locations of Weill Cornell via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	48	Denise Rickles	(i) NYU Langone is in MAPP. But ambulatory doctors can decide themselves, Dr. Minkowitz has not decided if she will participate.	Dr. Susan Minkowitz, NYU Langone		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	48	Denise Rickles	(i) not accepting MAPP	Dr. Katherine Victoria Yao, Weill Cornell		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	49	Edward W Smith	(i) listed as in network, (ii) not been officially contacted, (iii) will not be accepting.	Palm Harbor Family Practice, Dr. Matthew Dorman	Palm Coast Florida	PAR	Contacted by Email.

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
178	49	Edward W Smith	(i) listed as in network, (ii) have not been contacted.	Advanced Urology, DR. Terrence Reegan		PAR	Contacted by Email.
178	51	Barbara G. Rons	(i) listed as in network, (ii) not been officially contacted, (iii) will not be accepting.	Palm Harbor Family Practice, Dr. Matthew Dorman	Palm Coast Florida	PAR	Contacted by Email
178	51	Barbara G. Rons	(i) listed as in network, (ii) have not been contacted.	The Heart Center of Flagler, Dr. Melcher Gonzelez		PAR	Contacted by Email
178	51	Barbara G. Rons	(i) listed as in network, (ii) have not been contacted.	Dr. Wallace Combs		PAR	Contacted by Email
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) listed as in network, (ii) does not accept	Dr. Jonathan Hersche		PAR	Contacted by Email
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) listed as in network, (ii) has called customer service nad cannot get a straight answer.	Dr. Andres Ruiz	FL	PAR	Contacted by Email
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) listed as in network, (ii) takes MA but has never heard of MAPP, (iii) has not been contacted.	Dr. Amal Hanna	FL	PAR	Contacted by Email
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) listed as in network, (ii) have not heard of MAPP, (iii) have not been contacted.	Dr. Robert Bader	FL	PAR	Contacted by Email
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) listed as in network, (ii) have not heard of MAPP, (iii) have not been contacted.	Dr. Joshua Rubin	FL	PAR	Contacted by Email
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) listed as in network, (ii) have not heard of MAPP, (iii) have not been contacted.	Dr. Tatiana Lee-Chee	FL	PAR	Contacted by Email
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) not listed in network	Dr. Hendra Shah	FL	Non PAR	
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) not listed in network	Dr. Dipen Parekh	FL	Non PAR	
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) not listed in network	Dr. Sanjoy Punnen	FL	Non PAR	Sanoj (spelling)
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) not listed in network	University of Miami	FL	Non PAR	
178	53	Edwin Shorr	(i) not listed in network	Broward Health North	FL	Non PAR	
178	55	Ellen Levine	Member could not make contact	PCP	NY possibly	N/A	
178	55	Ellen Levine	Office said they would accept new plan.	Dermatologist	NY possibly	N/A	
178	55	Ellen Levine	(i) office said new plan accepted, (ii) had not received any information/contact	Cardiologist	NY possibly	N/A	
178	55	Ellen Levine	(i) office is out of network, but since PPO they will accept payment and member makes up difference., (ii) didn't know if information had been provided.	Gastro Intestinal	NY possibly	N/A	
178	56	Ellen Metzger	(i) listed as in network, (ii) office could not confirm, (iii) office has not been contacted.	Dr. Venis Fanous		PAR	1/28, Carmen, OM, states they do not accept GHI/ Emblem. I explained as long as they are a medicare provider they could continue to see the CoNY retirees and bill the local Blue Plan for services. She is familiar with billing out of state BC/BS. She says she believes 2 retirees have called regarding Dr. Fanous participation. I directed her to Horizon's Newsletter announcement for additional information.

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
178	56	Ellen Metzger	(i) listed as in network, (ii) office could not confirm, (iii) office has not been contacted.	Dr. Joel Kates		PAR	Contacted 1/14; telephonic (spoke to office; directed to billing company;no answer)
178	56	Ellen Metzger	(i) listed as in network, (ii) office could not confirm, (iii) office has not been contacted.	Dr. Heather Gibbons		PAR	Contacted 1/14; telephonic (spoke to office)
178	56	Ellen Metzger	(i) listed as in network, (ii) office could not confirm, (iii) office has not been contacted.	Dr. Josh Glatman		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) Contacted 1/14; telephonic (Spoke to Office)
178	56	Ellen Metzger	(i) listed as in network, (ii) office could not confirm, (iii) office has not been contacted.	Dr. Valerie Peck		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
178	56	Ellen Metzger	(i) not in network.	Dr. Mark Wolfman		PAR	Contacted 1/14; telephonic (left message)
178	58	Hope McGuire	(i) have not heard of MAPP, (ii) do not accept MAPP	Emory Hospital	Georgia	PAR	To communicate to several locations of Emory via Postcard (2/4/2022)
178	60	James Collins	(i) website lists approved MA plans, and MAPP was not listed, (ii) not aware of plan, (iii) have not received communication.	Cleveland Clinic Hospital		PAR	To communicate to several location of Cleveland Clinic Hospitals via Postcard (2/4/2022)
Affadavit 179							
179	1	Janet Kroben	Called provider's office and told that they did not include the MAPP Plan and that they have not been contacted by NYC or the Alliance.	Dr. Kathryn Malone at John Muir Berkley Outpatient Center	Oakland, CA	PAR	Communicated to several locations of John Muir Berkly via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	1	Janet Kroben	(i) Dr. not mentioned in Find Care. She was told to call MAPP and give UCSF's tax ID number, and ask MAPP if UCSF is being accepted. (ii) Dr. says they have not been contacted; and (iii) MAPP is not listed on the health plan page of the Dr.'s website.	Dr. Natalie A. Marshall at UCSF Berkeley Outpatient Center.		PAR	Communicated to several locations of UCSF via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	1	Janet Kroben	(i) Dr. Not listed on Findcare, (ii) MAPP is not on the list of plans the Dr. accepts, (iii) not on the Dr.'s website, and (iv) Dr.'s office has a separate department for any contact by City/Alliance.	Dr. Pavithra Venkat at Sutter Health's Milvia Care Center		PAR	Communicated to several locations of Sutter Health via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	2	Janet Kroben	(i) not listed in Findcare, (ii) were told to contact MAPP to determine if the doctor is accepted, (iii) do not know if contact has been made, (iv) MAPP is not listed on Dr.'s website	Dr. Madhulika Varma UCSF Mission Bay Campus		Non PAR	Communicated to several locations of UCSF via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	4	Jean Metzger Rayfield	(i) Dr. told that he does not and will not accept any MA plans. (ii) office has not received any communications regarding MAPP.	Retina doctor (No name given)	Essex County, New Jersey	N/A	
179	4	Jean Metzger Rayfield	(i) Dr. currently accepts AARP MA. (ii) office has not been contacted by the Alliance. (iii) Dr. has not heard of the plan so does not know if they are accepting it.	Urologist office (No name given)		N/A	
179	4	Jean Metzger Rayfield	(i) office not contacted, (ii) has not heard of plan, (iii) does accept United, BCBS MA and AARP MA.	PCP (no name given)		N/A	
179	4	Jean Metzger Rayfield	(i) not been contacted, (ii) not heard of the plan, (iii) accepts United, Aetna, and Oxford MA Plans.	Orthopedist (no name given)		N/A	
179	6	Joanne MacDonald	(i) Dr. not been contacted by the Alliance about MAP. Had received notice that it would be starting on 4/1/22. (ii) Will not be accepting the plan and knows nothing about the plan. (iii) Not on the Emblem Provider list.	Dr. Joseph Baudille (chiropractor)		Non PAR	1/28, Left a message on general VM. 1/28, spoke with Dr. Baudille. He was aware of the change bt had concerns with his current claims being denied by Medicare not being primary I suggested he speak with the member and to see if they have other coverage.

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
179	7	Joanne Poccia	(i) Told hospital will NOT be accepting the Plan. (ii) if insurance plan not listed, then they do not take it.	Columbia Presbyterian Hopsital		PAR	Contacted 1/15; telephonic (spoke to office) Communicated to several locations of Columbia Presbyterian Hospital via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	7	Joanne Poccia	(i) knew nothing of the plan, and (ii) will not be accepting it.	Columbia Pulmonary Doctors		PAR	Contacted 1/15; telephonic (spoke to office)
179	8	John A Lazzaro	(i) no information regarding new plan, (ii) have not been contacted, and (iii) will not accept this MA program.	Banner Hopsital Neuroscience Institute		PAR	
179	8	John A Lazzaro	(i) no information regarding new plan, (ii) since they have no information, they will not accept the Plan.	Dewey Medical Center,		Non PAR	
179	9	John A Lazzaro	(i) has not been notified of the plan, (ii) has no information on plan, (iii) will not accept plan.	Desert Center for Allergy and Chest Diseases,		PAR	
179	9	John A Lazzaro	(i) have not been notified of the plan, (ii) have no information about the plan, (iii) will not accept the plan. *Note, closest 911 receiving hospital.	Dignity Health Yavapai Medical Center,		Non PAR	
179	13	Judith Palmer	(i) listed in network on plan website, (ii) never notified of plan, (iii) will not take plan.	Gaylon Owens, Carolina Internal Medical Associates,		Non PAR	1/28, office was closed for lunch. Unable to leave a message. 1/31, closed for lunch.
179	13	Judith Palmer	(i) listed in network on plan website, (ii) never notified of plan, (iii) will not take plan "Because it is exclusive to NYC retirees"	William L. Haynes and Jeffrey B. Goldstein, Asheville Eye Associates,		PAR	1/28, Diane, billing, provided information on change. Also, left a message for Erica, OM.
179	13	Judith Palmer	(i) Dorris is in network on website, DeSouza is not, (ii) never notified of plan, (iii) will not accept plan.	Logan Desouza and Hugh Dorris, Forest Dermatology,		Non PAR	1/28, Left a detailed message for Wendy, OM. 1/31, Kate, billing, left a detailed message regarding change.
179	13	Judith Palmer	(i) listed in network on plan website, (ii) never notified of plan, (iii) wont' accept-wont' work with any Emblem associated plan.	Theodore Rhoney, Asheville Ear, Nose and Throat,		Non PAR	1/28, Michelle, billing, provided her detaild information regarding change for Retirees.
179	13	Judith Palmer	(i) listed in network on plan website, (ii) never notified of plan, (iii) Will accept as long as care provided in NC is covered.	William R. Harlan, Digestive Health Partners,		PAR	1/28, Tracy, billing, provided information regarding change for the Retirees and directed her to the Horizon website for more information.
179	13	Judith Palmer	(i) not listed on plan website, (ii) have not been notified of plan.	Trevor Austin, Messino Care Center,		Non PAR	1/28, Left message on general VM.
179	13	Judith Palmer	(i) listed in netowrk on plan website, (ii) have not been notified, (iii) won't accept.	Gordon Groh, Asheville Orthopaedic Associates,		Non PAR	1/28, Karen, billing, left a detailed message on her VM regarding transition for retirees.
179	14	Judith Palmer	(i) not notified, and (ii) won't accept.	Mission Hospital	Asheville, NC	Non PAR	1/28, hospital, Long hold time.
179	16	Julia Bruno	(i) have not been notified of the plan, (ii) received no communication on plan, and (iii) will not be accepting.	Dr. Robert Scharfman	Old Bridge, NJ	PAR	Contacted 1/18; telephone (spoke to office manager)
179	16	Julia Bruno	(i) have not been notified of plan, (ii) cannot say whether or not they will accept it.	Dr. Demetrios Grossos	Holmdel, NJ	PAR	Contacted 1/20; telephone (Hackensack Meridian Health)

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
179	18	Karen Engel	(i) listed as accepted MAP on the empireblue website. (ii) office was unaware of the Plan and had received no information.	Gerald Burford, Amelia Island Internists, Millenium Physicians Group	Tampa, FL	Non PAR	
179	20	Katherine Shorr	member made contact, no response from provider	Tatiana Lee-Chee	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	20	Katherine Shorr	member made contact, no response from provider	Jennifer Schnee	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	20	Katherine Shorr	(i) they take MA plans, (ii) have no heard of MAPP. Several other patients have asked. (iii) no one from the Plan has contacted the office.	Amal Hanna	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	20	Katherine Shorr	(i) have not received any information on the plan.	Marla Dudak	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	20	Katherine Shorr	Told NOT in the Plan.	Broward Health North	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	22	Kathleen Spiegel	(i) checked website of BCBS/Emblem (Findcare and Empireblue.com) and none of their doctors are listed, (ii) Ryan Health sent email saying "We do not currently know if we will be accepting that insurance yet. It all depends on credentialing. Please check back in a month and swe should hopefully have more information."	Ryan Health Center	NYC	PAR	If Ryan-Nena Community Health Center, Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	22	Kathleen Spiegel	(i) not listed on website, (ii) contacted office and told that they were looking into it.	Brian Waldron, New York Osteopathy		Non PAR	1/28, Samantha, OM, provided information regarding change and directed her to Empire's website for the announcement.
179	23	Lawrence Goldstein	(i) have not heard of or received info on MAPP., (ii) plan is not listed as accepted.	Wellstar Health	Atlanta, GA	PAR	To communicate to several location of Wellstar Health via Postcard (2/4/2022)
179	23	Lawrence Goldstein	(i) have not heard of or received info on MAPP., (ii) plan is not listed as accepted.	Piedmont Healthcare	Atlanta, GA	PAR	To communicate to several locations of Piedmont via Postcard (2/4/2022)
179	23	Lawrence Goldstein	(i) have not heard of or received info on MAPP., (ii) plan is not listed as accepted.	Georgia Urology	Atlanta, GA	PAR	To communicate to several location of Georgia Urology via Postcard (2/4/2022)
179	25	Lawren Konstan	Office stated that they will not participate in the MAPP, but listed in the Alliance link as participating.	Dr. Daniel Wasserman		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	26	Lisa Flanzraich	(i) said Dr. would accept. (ii) Told doctor that they were informed in writing that since Dr. does not accept Emblem that he would not accept Emblem's NYC plan. Office kept repeating that they would accept the plan because he accepts Medicare. Member said this is not Medicare. Could not get definitive answer.	Mt. Sinai Hospital, Faculty Practice , Dr. Charles Stacy.		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) Contacted 1/13; telephonic (left voicemail)
179	27	Lisa Flanzraich	(i) office confirmed that he will not accept NYC MA., (ii) he is out of network, (iii) not listed on FIND CARE, (iv) office has not been contacted.	Richard Karpe		Non PAR	1/28, left a detailed message for Mr. Karpe.
179	28	Lori Maslow	will take MAP	Dr. Saul Greenberg	Brooklyn NY	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021); (Provider's First Name is Aaron)
179	28	Lori Maslow	(i) office has not received any information on MAP, (ii) will not be accepting MAP.	Dr. Kevin Jovanovic	NYC	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	29	Marina S. Sgroi	(i) told by Doctor that she will NOT accept MAP, (ii) not listed as in network.	Carol Levy,	NYC	PAR	Communicated to several locations of Mt. Sinai via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
179	29	Marina S. Sgroi	(i) listed as a participating provider on plan's site, (ii) office could not confirm if she was participating, (iii) MAP is not listed as a plan it accepts, (iv) billing office had not been informed of the plan.	Dr. Mindy Satsky	NYC	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	29	Marina S. Sgroi	(i) listed as participating provider on plan's site, (ii) office could not confirm if she is participating, (iii) MAP is not listed as a plan they accept, (iv) have been informed of the plan, but don't know if they will accept.	Dr. Desiree Chow	NYC	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	29	Marina S. Sgroi	(i) listed as participating provider on the plan's site, (ii) notified of plan and told that they will accept. BUT MAP is not listed on the plans they accept. Recommended that they call the plan themselves.	Dr. Susan Polizzi	NYC	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	31	Michael Roeck	(i) some listed, some not, (ii) office has not received any information on the MAP.	Alan Blackburn, Gregory Benedict, Anuj Prasher, Daniel Jones - all same practice	Florida	Non PAR PAR PAR PAR	All PAR providers contacted by Email.
179	31	Michael Roeck	(i) all listed on MAP website, (ii) office said they do not accept MAP because it's not listed in their system, (iii) they have not been contacted.	Steven Kappler, Proandath Lall, Sukarya Pachaidee - all same practice	Florida	PAR PAR PAR	Contacted by email.
179	31	Michael Roeck	(i) office not contracted, (ii) have not received any information, (iii) show as in network on the website.	Sattar Gojraty	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	33	Nancy S. Waisman	hospital does not accept NYC MAP	St. Francis Hospital	Roslyn, NY	PAR	Communicated to several locations of St. Francis Hospital via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	34	Ricardo R. Lushington	Contacted 4 providers and all have said that they will NOT accept NYC MAPP and (ii) they have not received any communication about the plan.	No information given.	Georgia	N/A	
179	36	Sarah Shapiro	(i) office will accept MAP because they accept Medicare, but (ii) office has not received a call, (iii) office did receive a one page fax, (iv) office had to google prior authorization information because that was not provided.	Emil Baccash		PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will not accept.	Mayo Clinic		Non PAR	To communicate to several locations of Mayo Clinic via Postcard (2/4/2022)
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will possibly accept with prior authorization.	Dr. Hamdy Mohtaseb	Possibly Arizona	Non PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will not accept.	Dr. Aman K. Dalal	Possibly Arizona	Non PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will not accept.	Dr. Benjamin H. Venger	Possibly Arizona	Non PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will not accept.	Dr. Rohit Dwivedi	Possibly Arizona	PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	Will accept	First Chiropractic	Possibly Arizona	Non PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will not accept.	Dr. Kurtis Manley, More MD	Possibly Arizona	Non PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will not accept.	Dr. Neal Palejwala	Possibly Arizona	PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will possibly accept with prior authorization.	Bhanu Montgomery, Physical Therapy	Possibly Arizona	Non PAR	

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will not accept.	Valley View Medical Center	Possibly Arizona	Non PAR	
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will possibly accept with prior authorization.	LabCorp	Possibly Arizona	PAR	Communicated to several locations of LabCorp via Letters (11/12/2021)
179	38	Sharon M. Thomas Dooley	(i) never heard of MAP, (ii) Medicare Participants, (iii) Will possibly accept with prior authorization.	Quest	Possibly Arizona	PAR	Communicated to several locations of Quest via Letters (11/12/2021)
179	40	Sherry Poverstein	(i) in network with Medicare, but not on MAP care list, (ii) have not received outreach from MAP, (iii) not accepting MAP.	Dr. Nancy Liu	[REDACTED]	Non PAR	
179	40	Sherry Poverstein	(i) in network with Medicare, but not on the MAP care list, (iii) have not received outreach from MAP, (iv) if plan is Empire BCBS they would accept.	Dr. Shacher Peles	[REDACTED]	Non PAR	
179	40	Sherry Poverstein	(i) in network with Medicare and is on the MAP list, (ii) have had outreach, (iii) will not accept.	Dr. Barry Davis	[REDACTED]	PAR	
179	40	Sherry Poverstein	(i) in network with Medicare and on MAP care list, (ii) have not received outreach, (iii) will not accept MAP.	Dr. Bruce Martin	[REDACTED]	PAR	
179	40	Sherry Poverstein	(i) in network with Medicare and on MAP care list, (ii) have not received outreach from MAP, (iii) do not know if they will accept MAP.	Dr. Rahul Patel	[REDACTED]	PAR	
179	41		(i) in network with Medicare and on MAP care list, (ii) have not received outreach, (iii) not on their list of approved plans.	Dr. Dana Sands	[REDACTED]	Non PAR	
179	41		(i) in network with Medicare and on MAP care list, (ii) have not received outreach, (iii) will not accept.	Dr. Frank Shanley	[REDACTED]	PAR	1/28, office was closed. 1/31, kept getting busy signal
179	41		(i) in network with Medicare but not on MAP care list, (ii) office says they are out of network, (iii) will bill MAP and if paid the same rates as Medicare they will have patient pay its responsible charges.	Dr. Jeffrey Stahl	[REDACTED]	Non PAR	Communicated to several practitioners at NHPP Cardiology at Great Neck and to multiple NYU Langone locations via Postcard (2/4/2022) and Letter (11/12/2021)
179	41		(i) in network with Medicare and on MAP care list, (ii) have not had outreach, (iii) do not accept MAP.	Dr. Alessio Pigazzi	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	43	Terry Lieber	(i) in network on website, (ii) office said NOT accepting MAP, (iii) have not been contacted.	Dr. Mohammed Ali		PAR	If VA, to communicate via Postcard (2/4/2022)
179	43	Terry Lieber	(i) listed as in network provider on website, (ii) could not find MAP listed on accepted plans, (iii) has not been contacted by Alliance.	Dr. Harold Sirota	Catholic Health Service of Long Island	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) Contacted 1/13; telephonic (spoke to office)
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) not in Findcare, (ii) not accepting, (iii) not contacted.	Cintia Paz, Paz Family Medical	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	Non PAR	
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in Findcare, (ii) not accepting, (iii) not contacted.	Gjorgji Trnovski	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in Findcare, (ii) accepting, (iii) contact unknown.	Barry Ross	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in Findcare, (ii) accepting, (iii) contact unknown.	Jodi Fiedler	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in Findcare, (ii) not accepting, (iii) not contacted.	Steven Naide	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) Listed in findcare, (ii) unsure on accepting, (iii) not contacted.	G. Garmizo	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in findcare, (ii) left message at office.	Robert Topper	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) not in findcare, (ii) unsure if accepting, (iii) not contacted.	Baptist Health	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	Non PAR	
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in findcare, (ii) accepting if PPO, (iii) not contacted.	Diagnostic Centers of America	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	Non PAR	
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in findcare, (ii) accepting if PPO, (iii) not contacted.	Aker Kasten Eye Center	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in findcare, (ii) left message at office.	Cleveland Clinic Hospital	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	To communicate to several locations of Cleveland Clinic Hospitals via Postcard (2/4/2022)
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in findcare, (ii) left message at office.	Boca Raton Regional Hospital	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in findcare, (ii) left message at office.	Memorial Hospital	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	44	Tina Kaplan	(i) listed in findcare, (ii) left message at office.	Broward Health Hospital System	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	45		(i) not listed in findcare, (ii) not accepting, (iii) unsure about contact	Sylvester Comprehensive Cancer Center	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	Non PAR	
179	45		(i) some facilities listed in findcare, (ii) not all facilities are accepting, (iii) unsure of contact	Baptist Health System	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	Non PAR	
179	45		(i) listed in findcare, (ii) member not able to make contact	Holy Cross	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	45		(i) listed in findcare, (ii) member not able to make contact	Delray Medical Center	Broward County, FL, Palm Beach County, FL, or Miami FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	47	Tina Shapiro	(i) listed as in network on MAP site, (ii) office will not be participating in plan, (iii) office says they have not heard of the plan, (iv) have not been contacted by Plan.	Dr. Scott Wehrly	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	47	Tina Shapiro	(i) in network on site, (ii) not participating in MAP, (iii) not contacted by MAP.	Mr. Jose Mercado	Florida	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	49	Zina Greene and Kenneth Greene	(i) not in network provider, (ii) not been contacted by MAP.	Dr. Elvis Grandic		Non PAR	

Aff.	Page	Name / Organization	Claim	Provider Name	Location (if provided / relevant)	PAR Status	Method of Contact
179	51	Karen Mulfeld	(i) have not received any outreach, (ii) office is on MAP list, (iii) told that Doctor will not take plan.	The Medical Group of South Florida	[REDACTED]	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	53	Mark A Pozzuto	(i) office not accepting MAP, (ii) have not been contacted.	Lee Physicians Group - Dr. Damian Hanekom	Cape Coral, FL	PAR	Contacted by email.
179	55	Patricia Campagna	(i) not listed on MAP site, (ii) did not accept MA plans, but unsure about NYC MAP, (iii) have not been contacted.	Mukul Khurana	[REDACTED]	Non PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	55	Patricia Campagna	(i) on MAP site, (ii) does accept MA, (iii) not been contacted about MAPP.	TD Podiatry - Dr. Gabrielle Laurenti	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021)
179	56		(i) on MAP site, (ii) had not been contacted, (iii) member informed office that the company was "Alliance"	Dr. Philip J. Lup	[REDACTED]	PAR	Communicated via Postcard (1/21/2022) and Letters (11/12/2021) (Last name Lupo)
179	57	Rachel Cohn	(i) office said radiology and imaging are in network for most locations. Some locations not showing up "Baystate Franklin Medical Center, Baystate Mary Lane Hospital, and Baystate Primary Care."	Aimee LaPointe, Baystate Medical Center	Massachusetts	Non PAR PAR	